

Journal of Human Environment and Health Promotion

Print ISSN: 2476-5481 Online ISSN: 2476-549X

Investigating Antimicrobial Activity and Potential Health-Related Hazards of Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles as a Food Additive and Constitute of Food Packaging



a. Department of Food Science and Technology, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. b. Student Research Committee, Department of Agronomy, Food, Natural Resources, Animals and Environment (DAFNAE), University of Padova, Italy.

c. Department of Food Science and Engineering, Faculty of Industrial and Mechanical Engineering, Qazvin Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qazvin, Iran.

***Corresponding author:** Department of Food Science and Technology, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. Postal Code: 1477893855. E-mail: mdhnmlk@qiau.ac.ir

ARTICLE INFO

Article type: Review article

Article history: Received: 4 March 2024 Revised: 24 March 2024 Accepted: 18 April 2024

© The Author(s)

https://doi.org/10.61186/jhehp.10.2.63

Keywords:

Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles Food Safety Food Packaging Shelf life extension Health Risks

ABSTRACT

Background: Titanium dioxide (TiO₂) is employed in various forms, ranging from nano to macro, in food products and packaging to prolong shelf life. However, recent research has shown potential health risks associated with its use. This review investigates the health implications of TiO₂ nanoparticles (NPs) in food packaging or additives, while also examining TiO₂'s antimicrobial properties and related mechanisms. **Methods:** The research extensively explored TiO₂ NPs' generation methods and antimicrobial potential, especially in the context of food packaging and cosmetics. A systematic search was conducted using Google Scholar, Pub Med, and Web of Science databases to identify relevant sources. A total of 97 sources were selected from 150, without date restrictions. These references, spanning 1972 to 2023, encompass diverse full-text English materials, including reviews, original research, conferences, handbooks, and book chapters. **Results:** Nanotechnology, specifically TiO₂ NPs, enhances food packaging for safety and sustainability. Innovations such as reinforced, active, and biodegradable packaging have emerged to address industry challenges, improving mechanical performance and

have emerged to address industry challenges, improving mechanical performance and extending shelf life. However, despite the benefits, concerns about the health and environmental implications of TiO₂ NPs have prompted regulatory reassessment. **Conclusion:** Addressing concerns about TiO₂ NPs in food packaging is crucial due to potential health and environmental risks. The recent ban imposed by the European Union on TiO₂ (E171) underscores the need for ongoing research and scrutiny to ensure

the safe integration of nanotechnology in food packaging.

1. Introduction

Nanotechnology is the science of building and developing materials and structures on a scale of a billionth of a meter. If a large molecule can be scaled down to nanometer size, it has the specific chemical and physical properties of the nanoparticles (NPs), which are very different from the major molecule characteristics. Despite the enormous development of nanotechnology in many areas.

nanotechnology in food packaging is still at the forefront. Since a wide range of nanomaterials with their functional properties can be used to improve packaging, the future of food packaging can be attributed to this technology (Kuswandi & Moradi, 2019). The most crucial advantage of nanotechnology in the food industry is the introduction of new food packaging technology and food preservatives. The growth of nanotechnology in agriculture and the food industry has made significant progress in recent years



How to cite: Maleki MH, Daneshniya M, Abdolmaleki F. Investigating Antimicrobial Activity and Potential Health-Related Hazards of Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles as a Food Additive and Constitute of Food Packaging. *J Hum Environ Health Promot.* 2024; 10(2): 63-73.



(Dasguptaal et al., 2015). In this regard, NPs can be used to increase the shelf life and improve the final quality of food due to their specific properties, including the ability to regulate the release of antioxidants, antibacterial agents, flavors, and enzymes (Daneshniya et al., 2020a). Nanocomposites, which are made from a combination of conventional food packaging materials with nanomaterials, have received significant attention due to their excellent mechanical performance, good antibacterial properties, and high resistance. According to different studies, the incorporation of TiO₂ into food packaging has formed three closely related categories of food packaging, namely, enhanced nanoparticle packaging, active and intelligent packaging, and biodegradable nanocomposite packaging (Daneshniya et al., 2021a; Latifi et al., 2021). Packaging of reinforced NPs can increase the surface area, which significantly improves mechanical performance such as flexibility, reduced gas permeability, temperature stability, moisture resistance, light and flame, and the use of NPs can be associated with the inclusion of antimicrobial properties for packaging materials (Latifi et al., 2021). In the section on active and intelligent packaging, "active" is a type of packaging that can eliminate undesirable flavor and improve the color and aroma of packaged materials, and "intelligent" means that relevant information monitors the quality of packaged food. Some of the bio-nanocomposites used in food packaging are active, releasing antimicrobial and antioxidant compounds by eliminating undesirable factors such as oxygen and water vapor to increase products' shelf life (Latifi et al., 2021: Abdolmaleki et al., 2023). This new branch of food packaging has played a pivotal role in extending the shelf life of various food products. his innovative packaging approach is particularly significant due to its impact on optimizing food packaging materials and offering highly biodegradable packaging solutions. Currently, most of the materials used in food packaging are plastic polymers that are non-biodegradable and cause irreparable damage to the environment. These non-biodegradable plastics pose a serious threat to humans and the environment (Kirwan & Strawbridge, 2003). The time required to decompose different types of plastics varies. This timeframe can be anywhere from 15 years to never. In such circumstances, the importance of using biodegradable materials in food packaging becomes more pronounced. These include edible and biodegradable films made from recyclable materials (Tharanathan, 2003; Kuswandi, 2017). The use of nanocomposite packaging is increasing day by day, with the number of food products using nanocomposite packaging going from less than 40 in 2002 to over 400 in 2006. In the next decade, nanotechnology is expected to affect 25% of the food packaging market, which is currently estimated at 100 billion dollars. This suggests that in the coming decade, about 500 food products will be marketed with nanotechnology packaging (Latifi et al., 2021). The reason for this increase in market share is people's perception of the safety of fixed NPs and their inability to affect the quality of food; however, monitoring and strict surveillance of NPs incorporation in food packaging have created a major concern for

nanotechnology research and development in the food industry. Different experiments have shown that nanoparticles such as titanium dioxide (TiO₂) NPs used in packaging tend to have the potential to migrate to food and that consumption of these foods may pose a risk to consumers' health (Daneshniya et al., 2020a). However, TiO₂ has been recognized as non-toxic and safe by the American Food and Drug Administration (FDA) for human food, drugs, cosmetics, and food contact materials. The natural source of oxidized titanium is titanium oxide, also known as titanium (IV) oxide or titanium (Thiruvenkatachari et al., 2008; Emamifar, 2011). Food preservation possesses a critical importance for the food industry. In the development of new antimicrobial agents and addressing food safety concerns, it is essential to reduce the occurrence and economic impact of foodborne illnesses (Carvalho, 2017; Nie et al., 2017; Myszka et al., 2019). There is currently significant interest in the selfdisinfecting characteristic of TiO₂ for meeting hygienic design demands in food processing and packaging surfaces. Even though the bactericidal and fungicidal effects of TiO_2 on Escherichia coli. Salmonella choleraesuis. Vibrio parahaemolyticus, Listeria monocytogenes, Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Staphylococcus aureus. Diaporthe actinidiae. and *Penicillium expansum* have been approved; its photocatalytic disinfection application for drinking water production was investigated as well (Thiruvenkatachari et al., 2008). The output of various microorganisms such as Lactobacillus Plantarum, Escherichia coli, Staphylococcus aureus. Salmonella. Alicvclobacillus acidoterrestris. and aerobic psychrotrophic, molds, and leaves can be minimized with the utilization of nanomaterials in food packaging (Emamifar et al., 2010; Fernández et al., 2009; Jin & Gurtler, 2011; Nobile et al., 2004; An et al., 2008). TiO_2 is also being applied directly to foods. This metal oxide is a white, odorless, and tasteless compound widely used as a food additive to enhance the visual appeal of various products. Commonly identified by the E number E171, TiO₂ is employed in a variety of food items, including confectionery, baked goods, sauces, and dairy products, primarily due to its ability to impart a bright white color (Jovanović, 2015). One of the primary functions of titanium dioxide in the food industry is its role as a whitening agent. It imparts a clean and bright appearance to food products, making them more visually appealing to consumers. This is especially crucial in candies, icing, and certain dairy products. TiO₂'s ability to provide opacity and coverage is exploited in applications such as coatings and fillings. It helps create a uniform color and prevents the transparency of certain food items, ensuring a consistent visual experience (Boutillier et al., 2021). Regarding its regulation, In the European Union (EU), no specific maximum level for E171 has been stipulated (Winkler et al., 2018). The Joint Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)/World Health Organization (WHO) Expert Committee on Food Additives refrained from establishing an acceptable daily intake (ADI) for TiO₂, citing its minimal oral absorption rate, which does not exceed 0.1 %. In the United States, the utilization of the food additive TiO₂ dates back to 1966, with the Food and Drug



Administration (FDA) generally recommending concentrations below 1 % by weight of the food. Nevertheless, increasing apprehension has emerged concerning the safety of titanium dioxide as a food additive (Kamat, 2011). Recently, there has been growing concern over the safety of TiO₂ in different scales, from macro to nano. Studies have shown that nano-sized titanium dioxide particles can pass through the intestinal barrier and accumulate in various organs, including the liver, spleen, and brain. Moreover, studies on animals have shown that exposure to titanium dioxide can lead to inflammation, oxidative stress, and DNA damage (Catalano et al., 2020). Hence, we aimed to review recent progress in the utilization of TiO₂ with a focus on their antimicrobial activity and potential health-treating hazards regarding their utilization as food additives and in food packaging.

2. Materials and Methods

To ensure a comprehensive exploration of complex subjects, such as the generation methodologies of TiO₂ NPs, their antimicrobial potential (including induction approaches and underlying mechanisms), and the healthrelated issues associated with their application in packaging or direct use in cosmetic and food products, this study relied on a robust research methodology. The primary research tool employed was Google Scholar, along with Pub Med and Web of Science databases. The search strategy involved the integration of keywords such as "food packaging," "food additive," "shelf life extension," "antimicrobial," "hazards," and "regulations" with "Titanium Dioxide Nanoparticles" to retrieve pertinent literature on the designated subject matter. This inquiry yielded a total of 150 sources. To streamline the references, the authors meticulously selected 97 sources. Notably, the selection process did not impose additional criteria, including publication dates. Consequently, the chosen articles span from 1972 to 2023. It is important to highlight that all selected references are accessible with full text in English and include all types of papers, including reviews, original research, conferences, as well as other resources like handbooks, and book chapters.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1 Generation of TiO₂ NPs

Heat or mass transfer, nanoscale reaction engineering, nanobiotechnology, and molecular synthesis are used as the methods of nano-food packaging preparations. Generated nanocomposite polymers can be used in food packaging to enhance packaging's barrier properties, including ceasing the penetration of carbon dioxide, moisture, and oxygen into the packaging. Furthermore, these polymers can be utilized in active packaging aiming at delaying or restraining microbial growth and the spoilage of food. Intelligent packaging is another sort of packaging in which nanocomposites can be used to monitor food health. Degradable biopolymers are another area in which

nanocomposites can be used for Improvements in biopolymers' physical and chemical consistency (Mei & Wang, 2020; Kim et al., 2022; Pirsa & Shamusi, 2019; Ding et al., 2020; Kraśniewska et al., 2020; Sun et al., 2020; Daneshniya et al., 2020a). As mentioned in Table 1, different methods can be utilized to generate TiO₂ NPs. Due to strong ultraviolet-blocking efficiency, TiO₂ is a widely studied semiconductor as it can effectively absorb short-wavelength light with considerable photostability. The integration of TiO₂ NPs into food packaging polymer films contributes to retaining high transparency and prevents the harmful impact of ultraviolet irradiation on food components (Emamhadi et al., 2020; Duncan, 2011). According to Figure 1, structural construction from atom to cluster to NPs is a bottom-up or efficient method. The most widely used method for handling NPs has been sol-gel, and recent biosynthesis has attracted the attention of the scientific community (Chaudhary et al., 2020).

	Table	1. Different methods	to prepare NPs	(Chaudhary	et al., 2020)
--	-------	----------------------	----------------	------------	---------------

Bottom-up approach		Top-down approach	
Method	NPs	Method	NPs
Sol-gel method	Carbon, metal, and metal oxide- based	Thermal decomposition method	Carbon and metal oxide- based
Chemical vapor deposition (CVD) method	Carbon and metal oxide- based	Nanolithograph y method	Metal-based
Spinning method	Organic polymers	Mechanical milling method	Metal, oxide, and polymer-based
Pyrolysis method	Carbon and metal oxide- based	Sputtering method	Metal oxide- based
Biosynthesis method	Organic polymers and metal- based	Laser ablation method	Carbon and metal oxide- based



Figure 1. Top-down and Bottom-up approaches (Daneshniya et al., 2020b)

offer a more affordable and secure food packaging option in

3.2 Antimicrobial activity of TiO₂ NPs

According to Figure 2, the antimicrobial activity of metal NPs may be related to several mechanisms. The NPs can directly interact with the microbial cells or, as the precedent, interrupt transmembrane electron transfer, disrupt/ penetrate the cell envelope, oxidize cell components, or produce secondary products such as reactive oxygen species (ROS) or dissolved heavy metal ions cause damage (Li et al., 2008; Daneshniya et al., 2020b).



Figure 2. Microbial inactivation in microbial cells through metal NPs (Hoseinnejad et al., 2018)

The mechanism of antimicrobial action of TiO_2 , shown in Figure 2, is based on the decay of the microorganism by hydroxyl radicals and ROS produced through a light reaction in water media. Hydroxyl radicals inactivate microorganisms by oxidizing their unsaturated phospholipids parts of the plasma membrane. According to Figure 3, the initial step for TiO_2 to induce its antimicrobial activity is to be exposed to ultraviolet light, where excitation with energy beyond the corresponding band gap (approximately 3.2 eV), forms energy-rich electron-hole pairs. At the exterior of the material, such charge carriers interact with microorganisms in a biocide manner (Hoseinnejad et al., 2018; Hrnjak-Murgic, 2015).



Figure 3. Antimicrobial impact of TiO2 (Hrnjak-Murgic, 2015)

Silver (Ag), gold (Au), zinc oxide (ZnO), silica (SiO₂), titanium dioxide (TiO₂), alumina (Al₂O₃), and iron oxides (Fe₃O₄, Fe₂O₃) are metal and metal oxide nanomaterials widely used as antimicrobial agents. Nano-zinc oxide and magnesium oxide have recently been discovered to have antimicrobial effects. Zinc oxide and TiO₂ NPs are expected to

the future compared with silver NPs (Chaudhry et al., 2008). TiO₂ NPs are highly regarded due to their low production cost, chemical stability, photocatalytic activity, and favorable antimicrobial effect. Non-toxic and antimicrobial activity against various microbes has led to the use of TiO₂ as a suitable component in food packaging. The FDA has endorsed the utilization of TiO₂ in medicines, cosmetics, and food contact surfaces (Bodaghi et al., 2013). Regarding the antimicrobial activity of TiO₂, two model bacterial strains, Gram-negative Escherichia coli, and Gram-positive Bacillus subtilis, were used to examine the toxic effects associated with TiO₂ water suspensions. It was concluded that in the presence of light, the antibacterial activity of TiO₂ against Gram-negative and Gram-positive bacterial organisms was substantially higher compared to the dark, and cell death by TiO₂ in the darkness was less pronounced (Adams et al., 2006). To research the antimicrobial effects on Escherichia *coli in vitro* in a real food system, TiO₂-coated polymer films were made. The findings revealed that with the utilization of 20 W black-light illumination, the film coated with TiO₂ powder has a higher antimicrobial activity with a 3 CFU/mL reduction of *Escherichia coli* compared to uncoated film (only 1 log CFU/mL reduction after three h of illumination) (Chawengkijwanich & Hayata, 2008). Polyethylene films produced utilizing blown film extruders with and without incorporated TiO₂ showed that the blank film did not have antibacterial activity. In contrast, the polyethylene film with incorporated TiO₂ showed the following antibacterial activity with ultraviolet light for an hour, eliminating 89.3 % of Escherichia coli, and 95.2 % of Staphylococcus aureus (Xing et al., 2012). Using blown film extrusion, the low-density polyethylene/TiO₂ film was generated and tested on Pseudomonas spp. and Rhodotorula mucilaginosa, which revealed vigorous antimicrobial activity in the films. These findings show that extrusion-prepared plastic films with embedded TiO₂ NPs could be successfully used in food packaging applications (Bodaghi et al., 2013). TiO₂-coated films can reduce the microbial contamination of food products on the surface and reduce the risk of microbial growth in fresh products (Chawengkijwanich & Hayata, 2008). The addition of silver to TiO_2 can also boost the antibacterial properties of polypropylene nanocomposites. It was concluded that silver particles were filled with TiO₂ and that the composition of TiO_2 had no crystalline alteration. These nanocomposites have been found to have a high bactericidal effect since almost 98 % of Staphylococcus bacteria areas were eliminated after 10 min on antibacterial polypropylene relative to neat polypropylene, where only 10 % of the bacteria were killed during the same period. This composite's bactericidal effect is substantial, and such composites are a potential candidate for many applications where a bactericidal effect is needed (Ahmadi et al., 2009). Investigation of polypropylene nanocomposite antibacterial operation with silver/TiO₂ with varying filler proportions (0-1 % by weight) indicated that with a composite packed with 0.75 % of particles, the optimal bacterial behavior was seen (Dastjerdi et al., 2008).



*3.2.1 Interaction of TiO*₂ *NPs under ultraviolet and photocatalytic activity*

Due to its desirable characteristics, TiO₂ is one of the most tested oxide NPs for ultraviolet blocking and is very desirable in practical applications. TiO₂, widely used as a filler and pigment, may also usually be effective as an absorber that selectively absorbs and re-emits ultraviolet light at a less damaging wavelength, predominantly as heat. This TiO₂ behavior has been depicted in Figure 4. In order to satisfy the reduced ultraviolet percentage transmission criteria for the particular application, the polymer form, the ultraviolet absorber type, the thickness of the plastic component, and the concentration of the ultraviolet absorber need to be addressed in each application (Hrnjak-Murgic, 2015; Cheremisinoff, 1997; Frank et al., 2002).



Figure 4. TiO $_2$ behavior under ultraviolet light. ultraviolet-visible (Hrnjak-Murgic, 2015)

Ilmenite was found in 1791 with TiO₂. In 1929, TiO₂'s photoactivity was first reported when it was used in buildings as white pigments. Many TiO₂ polymorphs exist; anatase, rutile, and brookite, which were found in 1801, 1803, and 1825, are the recognized phases of TiO₂. The metastable forms of anatase and brookite can be irreversibly converted by heating to stable rutile, the naturally occurring TiO₂ state (Hanaor & Sorrell, 2011). The photodegradation of a broad range of environmental pollutants is the most promising field of TiO₂ photocatalysis; complex organic compounds and inorganic products, for example, are converted into CO₂ and innocuous inorganic anions. As a photocatalyst, TiO₂ has demonstrated tremendous promise for wastewater detoxification or remediation. During the decontamination process, TiO₂ NPs may be freely suspended in wastewater or deposited on substrates (Philippopoulos & Nikolaki, 2010; Sawunyama et al., 1997), which can, in turn, play a critical role in treating the wastewater in the food industry and other sectors, aiming at reaching sustainable food production. To provide an effective health care system, hazardous chemical, and microbial pollutants should be inhibited from developing. Consequently, the process of

manufacturing and employing effective materials rendering both photocatalytic and antimicrobial features is critical. With their higher wavelength ultraviolet absorption (UV-A 320-400 nm), semiconductors like TiO₂, SnO₂, and ZnO are extremely active under ultraviolet light irradiation. There are numerous fields in which TiO₂ NPs' photocatalytic behavior has been studied, such as in photocatalytic water splitting, photocatalytic self-cleaning, wastewater purification, photoinduced super hydrophilicity, photovoltaics, photosynthesis gap, and antibacterial/antimicrobial activity (Daneshniya et al., 2021b; Fujishima & Honda, 1972; Fujishima et al., 2000; Ni et al., 2007; Hashimoto et al., 2005; Pozzo et al., 1997; Konstantinou & Albanis 2004; Carp et al., 2004; Grätzel, 2005; Umadevi et al., 2013; Yu et al., 2013). TiO₂NPs received much attention in active food packaging, the main reason for which can be related to the remarkable antimicrobial properties of these particles. Due to their photocatalytic activity, these particles can have high oxidizing properties after exposure to ultraviolet rays and effectively destroy the microorganism's cell structure's organic compounds. Photocatalytic activity is usually an expected performance of semiconductor NPs, which has been investigated for many NPs. According to Figure 5, when a semiconductor surface is exposed to ultraviolet light, a specific wavelength is absorbed, which eventually transmits electrons from the Valance Band (VB) surface to the Conduction band (CB) (Daneshniya et al., 2021b; Jain & Vaya, 2017). These two levels are present in all semiconductors, and the energy difference between these two levels is called the band gap. After the electron is transferred between the two surfaces. the electron-hole pair remains in the valence band. These holes create a high reduction and oxidation potential for the metal (Nabika & Unoura, 2016). Figure 6 shows the mechanism of photocatalytic activity.



Figure 5. Mechanism of Photocatalytic Activity (Nabika & Unoura, 2016)

TiO₂ is expected to be in three forms, namely anatase, rutile, and brookite. Anatase has high photochemical activity and, under the action of ultraviolet light, can dissolve organic compounds. As it is stable only at low temperatures, brookite has no great functional importance, while rutile has some intriguing features. Rutile implies ultraviolet light absorption up to visible light wavelength proximity and transparency at visible light wavelengths. As a result, rutile-containing polymer nanocomposites can be of considerable use both in the manufacture of visually transparent ultraviolet films and in coatings for ultraviolet-sensitive materials (Maleki & Daneshniya, 2021). Rutile TiO₂ has photocatalytic activity only under ultraviolet irradiation, which usually limits its visible light use (Li et al., 2019). A successful way to minimize band-gap energy and increase the photocatalytic function of TiO₂ under visible light is the insertion of an Ag nanoparticle into TiO₂ (Lungu et al., 2014). Anatase and rutile have a band difference of 3.2 and 3.0 eV, respectively. Among these two groups, anatase is considered the most active form; as shown in Figure 6, a sharp decrease in activity is evident given the action spectrum of anatase roughly above 385nm (Fronzi et al., 2016; Kaplan et al., 2016). The greater surface area of anatase at moderate temperatures in the metastable state is often useful as reaction enhancers in photocatalysis and catalysis (Reidy et al., 2006; Dastjerdi & Montazer, 2010). Chemical reactions in anatase particles can produce highly reactive species during the photocatalytic process. An electron-hole pair is created due to the transmission of an electron from the valence to the conduction band whenever TiO₂ NPs are irradiated with photons at wavelength ~ 385 nm. The energy/band gap is defined as the energy disparity between the unfilled conduction band's low-energy electrons and the high valence band's filled energy (Dworniczek et al., 2016).



Figure 6. Ultraviolet area for TiO₂ photoactivity (Nabika & Unoura, 2016)

On the surface of TiO₂, as it is exposed to ultraviolet radiation, two genres of photochemical reactions can be observed; redox reaction excited by photons occurring in the adsorbed compounds and hydrophilic alteration by photons of TiO₂ itself. Concerning the first reaction, water and oxygen react with photogenerated holes and electrons, and then, along with other ROS comprising hyperoxide anions (O⁻²) and hydrogen peroxide (H₂O₂), extremely reactive hydroxyl (·OH) radical groups are formed. Hence, TiO₂ can both kill bacteria and simultaneously disintegrate toxins that are produced by bacteria. This process can be divided into five distinct stages (Hou et al., 2015; Pleskova et al., 2016; Rincón & Pulgarin, 2007; Zou & Zhu, 2007; Zhang et al., 2009):

1. Absorption of photons by TiO₂, which is needed for reactions (hv \leq EG = 3.2e).

$$(TiO_2) + hv \longrightarrow e^-_{CB} + h^+_{VB}$$

2. Oxygen ionosorption process, which modifies the degree of oxidation of oxygen.

$$(O_2)_{ads} + e_{CB} \longrightarrow O_{2}^{-2}$$

3. OH functional groups are neutralized by photo holes, and ultimately, OH radicals are yielded.

$$(H2O) \longrightarrow H^+ + OH^-_{ads} + h^+_{VB} \longrightarrow h^+ + OH^-_{ads}$$

4. ⁻OH radicals successively bombard the organic-based reactant, and thus oxidation occurs.

$$R + OH \longrightarrow R + H_2O$$

5. The functional group is oxidated directly as it reacts with holes.

 $R + h^+ \longrightarrow R^{++} \longrightarrow$ degraded output

3.3 TiO₂NPs health-threatening hazards

Nanomaterials have been used in many industries, such as the food industry, because of their unique properties. However, some of these properties, such as high chemical reactivity and good bioavailability, have increased their potential for toxicity so that a similar volume of a substance in the nano-sized state has greater toxicity potential than in the case of larger particles (Kirwan & Strawbridge, 2003: Tharanathan, 2003; Maleki & Daneshniya, 2021). Research in different regions like China, South Korea, Japan, the European Union, and the United States has shown that NPs can be toxic to humans and the environment due to various physico-chemical properties such as size, morphology, and surface properties (Han et al., 2011). The migration of NPs from food packaging to beverages or food is commonly cited as the primary concern. Research has shown that the smaller the NPs and the lower the density, the higher the likelihood of these particles being transferred to the food and causing health problems for the consumer (OECD, 2009). According to the European Center for Ecotoxicology and Toxicology of Chemicals (ECETOC), inhalation, skin contact, and oral administration are the main ways in which humans are exposed to NPs (Borm et al., 2006). It also has been proved by several studies that ingestion, pulmonary absorption (mostly by inhalation), epidermal exposure, and injection are the four primary mechanisms of exposure to TiO₂ NPs in humans. Ingestion, inhalation, and injection of TiO₂ NPs all result in systemic disposal, according to researchers. However, when it comes to epidermal exposure, the findings are inconsistent (Shakeel et al., 2016). The NPs enter the lungs when inhaled and can enter the bloodstream. In skin contact with NPs, these substances can enter the cell in three ways, intracellular, intercellular, and follicular penetration (Zaiter et al., 2022). If the NPs are transported to the food, the NPs are digested and accumulate in the digestive tract. They are then absorbed through the intestinal epithelium and can pass to other parts. Previous research has shown that smaller NPs are usually faster than larger adsorbed particles and



more easily dispersed by anionic NPs through the epithelial surface (Han et al., 2011). Cationic NPs are typically trapped due to the negative charge of mucus (Szentkuti, 1997). Hence, the increasing use of TiO₂ NPs in food packaging as well as in the formulation of food and cosmetic products has raised concerns about potential hazards to human health and the environment, some of which have been mentioned in Table 2. TiO₂ has also been used as an ingredient in the food industry to improve the white color of some items, such as desserts and dairy products (Jovanović, 2015). Besides the migration of the packaging to the food, other issues mentioned in Table 3 are also related to the TiO₂ NPs utilized as additives. Normalized to the titanium per serving, chewing gums, sweets, powdered sugar toppings, and items with white icing possess the highest titanium content, according to a study that measured and analyzed the quantity of titanium in typical food products (Musial et al., 2020). In the United States, the difference in TiO_2 consumption between men and women was minimal. However, there was a considerable variation in intake between children and adults. Children may ingest up to four times the amount of TiO_2 per kilogram of body weight (kgbw) in comparison to an adult. This may be explained simply by their consumer preferences, which are mostly oriented on the flavor of sweet snacks, many of which include E171. As a result, eating choices have a role in TiO₂ exposure (Weir et al., 2012; Dudefoi et al., 2018). Since daily exposure to E171 can reach many hundreds of milligrams, with a significant

portion (approximately 36 %) appearing in the nano range, there are suspicions that long-term exposure to this compound could have detrimental effects on the human body (Jovanović et al., 2018). The European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) published a 're-evaluation of TiO₂ (E171) as a food additive' in response to this growing public health concern, based on documentation on TiO₂ usage levels and safety provided by various international associations, councils, and committees. The EFSA panel determined that orally given micro-and nano-TiO₂ had limited absorption and bioavailability. Except for a small quantity (less than 0.1 %) that is absorbed by gut-associated lymphoid tissue and transported to various organs, the majority of the TiO₂ eaten dosage is excreted unaltered in the feces. The panel concluded that in vivo, micro-and nano-sized particles are unlikely to pose a genotoxic risk (Geiss et al., 2020; EFSA, 2016). A year later, research found that orally delivered foodgrade TiO₂ nanoscale particles impair immunological homeostasis and cause cancer in rats. The French ANSES (Agency for Food, Environmental, and Occupational Health) released an opinion on TiO₂ NPs based on this paper, emphasizing the importance of completing rigorous research into the potential hazards associated with the use of E171. Because of the potential detrimental impacts on individuals and a lack of scientific data to prove its safety, France is the first country to prohibit the use of the E171 food additive. The limitations went into effect in 2020 (Bettini et al., 2017; ANSES, 2017; Arrêté, 2020).

Table 2. Issues associated with the utilization of the TiO₂ NPs as food additives and constitute a packaging

Area of use	Related-challenge	Reference
Specific to TiO2 NPs in the packaging	Migration of NPs	One of the primary concerns regarding TiO ₂ NPs in food packaging is their potential to migrate from the packaging materials into the food products they come into contact with. The small size of NPs can facilitate their movement through packaging barriers, especially in cases of fatty or oily foods or foods with a high water content. Studies have demonstrated that TiO ₂ NPs can indeed migrate into food, leading to possible human exposure through ingestion (Wang et al., 2016).
	Toxicity and Health Risks	Upon ingestion, $TiO_2 NPs$ can interact with cells and tissues in the human body, leading to concerns about their potential toxicity. While the exact mechanisms of nanoparticle toxicity are still being studied, research has shown that $TiO_2 NPs$ can induce oxidative stress, inflammation, and cellular damage. These adverse effects could potentially impact various organs and systems in the body (Sharma et al., 2019).
Common between the TiO2 NPs additive and its utilization in food	Gastrointestinal Effects	Studies on animals have shown that TiO ₂ NPs can accumulate in the gastrointestinal tract after ingestion. This accumulation has raised concerns about potential gastrointestinal effects, such as alterations in gut microbiota and intestinal barrier function. Moreover, the possibility of TiO ₂ NPs reaching the systemic circulation through the gut lining has raised questions about their impact on organs beyond the gastrointestinal tract (Gao et al., 2021).
packaging	Immunotoxicity	Research has indicated that TiO ₂ NPs can modulate the immune response, leading to immunotoxic effects. These NPs can interact with immune cells and influence their activity, potentially impairing immune system function. Prolonged exposure to TiO ₂ NPs may increase the risk of immune-related disorders and infections (Bettini et al., 2017).
	Genotoxicity and Carcinogenicity	Concerns have been raised regarding the genotoxicity and carcinogenicity of TiO_2 NPs. Some studies have suggested that TiO_2 NPs can cause DNA damage and initiate preneoplastic lesions, leading to the promotion of aberrant cell growth and tumor development. However, further research is needed to establish a definitive link between TiO_2 nanoparticle exposure and cancer (Bettini et al., 2017).
	Environmental Impact	In addition to human health concerns, the environmental impact of TiO ₂ NPs is also an area of interest. During the manufacturing, use, and disposal of food packaging materials containing TiO ₂ NPs, there is a possibility of nanoparticle release into the environment. These NPs could accumulate in soil and water bodies, potentially affecting aquatic organisms and soil microorganisms (Wojcieszeket al., 2020).

Finally, in a report No. E42022-0011, The European Commission has declared a prohibition on using E171 as a

food additive in the EU, beginning on February 7, 2022, with a six-month phase-out period until August 7, 2022, after



Antimicrobial Activity and Health-Related Hazards of TiO₂

which a full ban would apply. Annex II and III to Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 on food additives will be changed as a result of the publishing of Commission Regulation (EU) 2022/63 in the EU's Official Journal (OJ) on January 18, 2022. The Regulation also contains a determination to assess the need to keep E171 on the EU list of food additives for sole use as a color in medical goods or to remove it. The Commission previously issued Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2021/2090 in the OJ of the European Union on November 30, 2021, refusing the licensing of TiO₂ (E171) as a feed supplement for all animal species (EU, 2022). On the whole, the ultimate conclusions of the safety-related threats of TiO₂ NPs can be seen in Table 3. Various studies have already demonstrated that E171 has a genotoxic potential. In a study wherein an in vitro model with human Caco-2 and HCT116 cells was used to research the potentially toxic effects of E171, which contains fractions of micro-and NPs (MPs and NPs, respectively), it was discovered that E171defined as a mixture of 39 % TiO₂ NPs and 61 % MPs-had the highest capability to induce ROS generation in a cell-free environment, followed by NPs and MPs. However, only MPs demonstrated the ability to generate ROS in a cellular environment, which may result in a pro-inflammatory response. Nevertheless, the NPs did not promote the development of ROS, which was accounted for by the fact that, after internalization, they interact with cellular components that prevent the formation of ROS. This study also showed that all E171, NPs, and MPs caused single-strand DNA breakage in Caco-2 cells. The study authors hypothesized that compared to NPs or MPs alone, E171 was more hazardous to Caco-2 cells (Proquin et al., 2017). In another study, food-grade particle size distribution was used in a repeated 3-week oral administration of E171 to mice (E171 suspension dripping into the mouth of mice, 5 mg/kgbw for three days per week); results were related to both toxic outcomes, such as an inflammatory response and increased superoxide production in the digestive tract, and the deposition of TiO₂ in the internal organs, particularly in the liver and large intestine, where a three-fold increase in TiO₂ NPs was noted (Talamini et al., 2019).

Table 3. Safety-related TiO_2 NPs conclusions based on previous studies (Musial et al., 2020)

Type of	Conclusions		
Usage/Application			
of TiO ₂ NPs			
	The absorption of TiO2 from the digestive tract	Generally considered extremely low	
	Safety of long-term	Still uncertain: potential	
D = 1 = 11 ¹ C = 1	dietary exposure to	toxic effects may concern	
Food additive	TiO ₂ NPs	the absorption,	
E1/1		distribution, and	
		accumulation of 110 ₂ NPs	
	Potential risks caused	Genotoxicity,	
	by TiO ₂ NPs	inflammatory response,	
		carcinogenesis	
	Lack of established, acceptable daily intake limits.		

Authors' Contributions

Mohammad Hossein Maleki: data collection. Milad Daneshniya: study design; writing manuscript. Farzaneh Abdolmaleki: supervision of study; result validation.

Funding

No external funding was received.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Acknowledgements

None.

Ethical considerations

There were no ethical considerations to be considered in this research.

References

- 1. Abdolmaleki, F., Shirkhorshidi, S., & Daneshniya, M. (2023). Investigating the characteristics of basil seed gum-based film enriched with Echinophora Platyloba extract and its preservative effect on the quality of silver carp. *Journal of Research & Innovation in Food Science & Technology*, *11*(4).
- An, J., Zhang, M., Wang, S., & Tang, J. (2008). Physical, chemical and microbiological changes in stored green asparagus spears as affected by coating of silver nanoparticles-PVP. *LWT-Food Science and Technology*, 41(6), 1100-1107.
- Adams, L. K., Lyon, D. Y., & Alvarez, P. J. (2006). Comparative eco-toxicity of nanoscale TiO₂, SiO₂, and ZnO water suspensions. *Water Research*, 40(19), 3527-3532.
- 4. Ahmadi, Z., Ashjari, M., Hosseini, R., & Nia, J. R. (2009). Synthesis and morphological study of nanoparticles Ag/TiO₂ ceramic and bactericidal investigation of Polypropylene-Ag/TiO₂ composite. *Journal of Inorganic and Organometallic Polymers and Materials*, 19, 322-327.
- 5. Agence Nationale de Sécurité Sanitaire de l'Alimentation, de l'Environnement et du Travail (ANSES). (2017). Avis relatif à une demande d'avis relatif à l'exposition alimentaire aux nanoparticules de dioxyde de titane.
- Arrêté du 17 avril 2019 portant suspension de la mise sur le marché des denrées contenant l'additif e 171 (dioxyde de titane-TiO₂). (2020). https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/loda/id/JORFTEXT000038410047/.
- 7. Boutillier, S., Fourmentin, S., & Laperche, B. (2022). History of titanium dioxide regulation as a food additive: a review. *Environmental Chemistry Letters*, 1-17.
- Bodaghi, H., Mostofi, Y., Oromiehie, A., Zamani, Z., Ghanbarzadeh, B., Costa, C., ... & Del Nobile, M. A. (2013). Evaluation of the photocatalytic antimicrobial effects of a TiO₂ nanocomposite food packaging film by in vitro and in vivo tests. *LWT-Food Science and Technology*, *50*(2), 702-706.
- 9. Borm, P. J., Robbins, D., Haubold, S., Kuhlbusch, T., Fissan, H., Donaldson, K., ... & Oberdorster, E. (2006). The potential risks of nanomaterials: a review carried out for ECETOC. *Particle and fibre toxicology, 3*, 1-35.
- Bettini, S., Boutet-Robinet, E., Cartier, C., Coméra, C., Gaultier, E., Dupuy, J., ... & Houdeau, E. (2017). Food-grade TiO₂ impairs intestinal and systemic immune homeostasis, initiates preneoplastic lesions and promotes aberrant crypt development in the rat colon. *Scientific Reports*, 7(1), 40373.



- 11. Carvalho, F. P. (2017). Pesticides, environment, and food safety. *Food and Energy Security*, *6*(2), 48-60.
- Catalano, R., Labille, J., Gaglio, D., Alijagic, A., Napodano, E., Slomberg, D., ... & Pinsino, A. (2020). Safety evaluation of TiO₂ nanoparticle-based sunscreen UV filters on the development and the immunological state of the sea urchin Paracentrotus lividus. *Nanomaterials*, 10(11), 2102.
- Chaudhary, P., Fatima, F., & Kumar, A. (2020). Relevance of nanomaterials in food packaging and its advanced future prospects. *Journal of Inorganic* and Organometallic Polymers and Materials, 30(12), 5180-5192.
- Chaudhry, Q., Scotter, M., Blackburn, J., Ross, B., Boxall, A., Castle, L., ... & Watkins, R. (2008). Applications and implications of nanotechnologies for the food sector. *Food Additives and Contaminants, 25*(3), 241-258.
- Chawengkijwanich, C., & Hayata, Y. (2008). Development of TiO₂ powdercoated food packaging film and its ability to inactivate Escherichia coli in vitro and in actual tests. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, *123*(3), 288-292.
- 16. Cheremisinoff, P. (1997). *Handbook of engineering polymeric materials.* CRC Press.
- Carp, O., Huisman, C. L., & Reller, A. (2004). Photoinduced reactivity of titanium dioxide. *Progress in Solid State Chemistry*, 32(1-2), 33-177.
- Dasgupta, N., Ranjan, S., Mundekkad, D., Ramalingam, C., Shanker, R., & Kumar, A. (2015). Nanotechnology in agro-food: from field to plate. *Food Research International, 69*, 381-400.
- 19. Daneshniya, M., Maleki, M. H., Amini, F., Behrouzian, M., & Latifi, Z. (2020). Positive and negative aspects of nanocomposites utilization in food packaging. *3rd International Congress of Science, Engineering and Technology*, 21.
- 20. Daneshniya, M., Maleki, M. H., Mohammadi, M. A., Ahangarian, K., Kondeskalaei, V. J., & Alavi, H. (2021). Antioxidant and antimicrobial activity of ferula species' essential oils and plant extracts and their application as the natural food preservatives. *South Asian Research Journal of Natural Products*, 4(3), 1-23.
- Ding, L., Li, X., Hu, L., Zhang, Y., Jiang, Y., Mao, Z., ... & Sui, X. (2020). A nakedeye detection polyvinyl alcohol/cellulose-based pH sensor for intelligent packaging. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 233, 115859.
- 22. Duncan, T. V. (2011). Applications of nanotechnology in food packaging and food safety: barrier materials, antimicrobials and sensors. *Journal of Colloid and Interface Science*, 363(1), 1-24.
- 23. Daneshniya, M., Maleki, M. H., Ali Mohammadi, M., Jalilvand Nezhad, H., Keshavarz Bahadori, N., & Latifi, Z. (2020). Investigating the application of silver nanoparticles in active food packaging: antimicrobial properties and synthesis methods. *Chemistry Research Journal*, 5(3), 28-44.
- 24. Dastjerdi, R., Mojtahedi, M. R. M., & Shoshtari, A. M. (2008). Investigating the effect of various blend ratios of prepared masterbatch containing Ag/TiO₂ nanocomposite on the properties of bioactive continuous filament yarns. *Fibers and Polymers, 9*, 727-734.
- 25. Daneshniya, M., Maleki, M. H., Nezhad, H. J., Jalali, V., & Behrouzian, M. (2021b). Application of titanium dioxide (TiO₂) nanoparticles in packaging and coating of food products. 5th International Congress of Developing Agriculture, Natural Resources, Environment and Tourism of Iran.
- 26. Dastjerdi, R., & Montazer, M. (2010). A review on the application of inorganic nano-structured materials in the modification of textiles: focus on anti-microbial properties. *Colloids and Surfaces B: Biointerfaces*, 79(1), 5-18.
- Dworniczek, E., Franiczek, R., Kowal, K., Buzalewicz, I., Podbielska, H., & Tofail, S. A. (2016). Photocatalytic and antimicrobial activity of titania nanoparticles. *Electrically Active Materials for Medical Devices*, 193-208.

- Dudefoi, W., Terrisse, H., Popa, A. F., Gautron, E., Humbert, B., & Ropers, M. H. (2018). Evaluation of the content of TiO₂ nanoparticles in the coatings of chewing gums. *Food Additives & Contaminants: Part A*, 35(2), 211-221.
- Emamifar, A. (2011). Applications of antimicrobial polymer nanocomposites in food packaging. *Advances in Nanocomposite Technology*, 299-318.
- Emamifar, A., Kadivar, M., Shahedi, M., & Soleimanian-Zad, S. (2010). Evaluation of nanocomposite packaging containing Ag and ZnO on shelf life of fresh orange juice. *Innovative Food Science & Emerging Technologies*, 11(4), 742-748.
- Emamhadi, M. A., Sarafraz, M., Akbari, M., Fakhri, Y., Linh, N. T. T., & Khaneghah, A. M. (2020). Nanomaterials for food packaging applications: A systematic review. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, *146*, 111825.
- EFSA Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources added to Food (ANS). (2016). Re-evaluation of titanium dioxide (E 171) as a food additive. *EFSA Journal*, 14(9), e04545.
- 33. European Union. (2022). Titanium dioxide banned as a food additive in the EU, E42022-0011. https://apps.fas.usda.gov/newgainapi/api/Report/DownloadReportByFile Name?fileName=Titanium%20Dioxide%20Banned%20as%20a%20Food%20 Additive%20in%20the%20EU_Brussels%20USEU_European%20Union_E42 022-0011.pdf.
- 34. Fernández, A., Soriano, E., López-Carballo, G., Picouet, P., Lloret, E., Gavara, R., & Hernández-Muñoz, P. (2009). Preservation of aseptic conditions in absorbent pads by using silver nanotechnology. *Food Research International*, 42(8), 1105-1112.
- Frank, A., Leonard, H., Robert, L., Joseph, A., & Dennis, J. (2002). Encyclopedia of polymer science and technology. John Wiley & Sons.
- Fujishima, A., & Honda, K. (1972). Electrochemical photolysis of water at a semiconductor electrode. *Nature, 238*(5358), 37-38.
- Fujishima, A., Rao, T. N., & Tryk, D. A. (2000). Titanium dioxide photocatalysis. *Journal of Photochemistry and Photobiology C: Photochemistry Reviews*, 1(1), 1-21.
- Fronzi, M., Daly, W., & Nolan, M. (2016). Reactivity of metal oxide nanocluster modified rutile and anatase TiO₂: oxygen vacancy formation and CO₂ interaction. *Applied Catalysis A: General*, 521, 240-249.
- Grätzel, M. (2005). Solar energy conversion by dye-sensitized photovoltaic cells. *Inorganic Chemistry*, 44(20), 6841-6851.
- 40. Gao, Y., Li, T., Duan, S., Lyu, L., Li, Y., Xu, L., & Wang, Y. (2021). Impact of titanium dioxide nanoparticles on intestinal community in 2, 4, 6trinitrobenzenesulfonic acid (TNBS)-induced acute colitis mice and the intervention effect of vitamin E. *Nanoscale*, 13(3), 1842-1862.
- 41. Geiss, O., Ponti, J., Senaldi, C., Bianchi, I., Mehn, D., Barrero, J., ... & Anklam, E. (2020). Characterisation of food grade titania with respect to nanoparticle content in pristine additives and in their related food products. *Food Additives & Contaminants: Part A*, 37(2), 239-253.
- 42. Hoseinnejad, M., Jafari, S. M., & Katouzian, I. (2018). Inorganic and metal nanoparticles and their antimicrobial activity in food packaging applications. *Critical Reviews in Microbiology*, 44(2), 161-181.
- Hrnjak-Murgic, Z. (2015). Nanoparticles in active polymer food packaging. Smithers Pira.
- 44. Hanaor, D. A., & Sorrell, C. C. (2011). Review of the anatase to rutile phase transformation. *Journal of Materials Science*, *46*, 855-874.
- Hashimoto, K., Irie, H., & Fujishima, A. (2005). TiO₂ photocatalysis: a historical overview and future prospects. *Japanese Journal of Applied Physics*, 44(12R), 8269.



- 46. Hou, X., Ma, H., Liu, F., Deng, J., Ai, Y., Zhao, X., ... & Liao, B. (2015). Synthesis of Ag ion-implanted TiO₂ thin films for antibacterial application and photocatalytic performance. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 299, 59-66.
- 47. Han, W., Yu, Y., Li, N., & Wang, L. (2011). Application and safety assessment for nano-composite materials in food packaging. *Chinese Science Bulletin*, *56*(12), 1216-1225.
- 48. Jin, T., & Gurtler, J. B. (2011). Inactivation of Salmonella in liquid egg albumen by antimicrobial bottle coatings infused with allyl isothiocyanate, nisin and zinc oxide nanoparticles. *Journal of Applied Microbiology*, 110(3), 704-712.
- 49. Jovanović, B. (2015). Critical review of public health regulations of titanium dioxide, a human food additive. *Integrated Environmental Assessment and Management*, *11*(1), 10-20.
- 50. Jain, A., & Vaya, D. (2017). Photocatalytic activity of TiO₂ nanomaterial. *Journal of the Chilean Chemical Society*, *62*(4), 3683-3690.
- 51. Jovanović, B., Jovanović, N., Cvetković, V. J., Matić, S., Stanić, S., Whitley, E. M., & Mitrović, T. L. (2018). The effects of a human food additive, titanium dioxide nanoparticles E171, on Drosophila melanogaster-a 20 generation dietary exposure experiment. *Scientific Reports, 8*(1), 17922.
- 52. Kuswandi, B., & Moradi, M. (2019). Improvement of food packaging based on functional nanomaterial. *Nanotechnology: Applications in Energy, Drug and Food*, 309-344.
- 53. Kirwan, M. J., & Strawbridge, J. W. (2003). Plastics in food packaging. *Food Packaging Technology*, *1*, 174-240.
- 54. Kuswandi, B. (2017). Environmental friendly food nano-packaging. Environmental Chemistry Letters, 15(2), 205-221.
- Kamat, P. V. (2011). Dominance of metal oxides in the era of nanotechnology. *The Journal of Physical Chemistry Letters*, 2(7), 839-840.
- 56. Kim, I., Viswanathan, K., Kasi, G., Thanakkasaranee, S., Sadeghi, K., & Seo, J. (2022). ZnO nanostructures in active antibacterial food packaging: preparation methods, antimicrobial mechanisms, safety issues, future prospects, and challenges. *Food Reviews International*, *38*(4), 537-565.
- 57. Kraśniewska, K., Galus, S., & Gniewosz, M. (2020). Biopolymers-based materials containing silver nanoparticles as active packaging for food applications-a review. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 21(3), 698.
- Konstantinou, I. K., & Albanis, T. A. (2004). TiO₂-assisted photocatalytic degradation of azo dyes in aqueous solution: kinetic and mechanistic investigations: a review. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, 49(1), 1-14.
- 59. Kaplan, R., Erjavec, B., Dražić, G., Grdadolnik, J., & Pintar, A. (2016). Simple synthesis of anatase/rutile/brookite TiO₂ nanocomposite with superior mineralization potential for photocatalytic degradation of water pollutants. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, 181, 465-474.
- 60. Latifi, Z., Ghafuri, Z., Manochehri, S., Khaki Arani, S., Daneshniya, M., Roozbeh Nasiraie, L., Jafarian, S. (2021). Effect of using Hydroxy propyl methyl cellulose with extract of royal oil (Lepidium Sativum) in reducing oil absorption and quality of fried common carp fish fillet (Cyprinus Carpio). Journal of Food Technology and Nutrition, 125-39.
- 61. Li, Q., Mahendra, S., Lyon, D. Y., Brunet, L., Liga, M. V., Li, D., & Alvarez, P. J. (2008). Antimicrobial nanomaterials for water disinfection and microbial control: potential applications and implications. *Water Research*, 42(18), 4591-4602.
- 62. Li, W., Li, B., Meng, M., Cui, Y., Wu, Y., Zhang, Y., ... & Feng, Y. (2019). Bimetallic Au/Ag decorated TiO₂ nanocomposite membrane for enhanced photocatalytic degradation of tetracycline and bactericidal efficiency. *Applied Surface Science*, 487, 1008-1017.

- Lungu, M., Gavriliu, Ş., Enescu, E., Ion, I., Brătulescu, A., Mihăescu, G., ... & Chifiriuc, M. C. (2014). Silver-titanium dioxide nanocomposites as effective antimicrobial and antibiofilm agents. *Journal of Nanoparticle Research, 16*, 1-15.
- 64. Myszka, K., Leja, K., & Majcher, M. (2019). A current opinion on the antimicrobial importance of popular pepper essential oil and its application in food industry. *Journal of Essential Oil Research*, 31(1), 1-18.
- 65. Mei, L, & Wang, Q. (2020). Advances in using nanotechnology structuring approaches for improving food packaging. *Annual Review of Food Science and Technology*, *11*, 339-364.
- 66. Maleki, M. H., & Daneshniya, M. (2021). A Review on encapsulation methods, delivery systems and releasement mechanisms of bioactive peptides. 3rd International Congress On Engineering, Technology and Innovation.
- 67. Musial, J., Krakowiak, R., Mlynarczyk, D. T., Goslinski, T., & Stanisz, B. J. (2020). Titanium dioxide nanoparticles in food and personal care products-What do we know about their safety?. *Nanomaterials, 10*(6), 1110.
- 68. Nie, Y., Luo, F., Wang, L., Yang, T., Shi, L., Li, X., ... & Lin, Q. (2017). Antihyperlipidemic effect of rice bran polysaccharide and its potential mechanism in high-fat diet mice. *Food & Function*, 8(11), 4028-4041.
- Nobile, M. D., Cannarsi, M., Altieri, C., Sinigaglia, M., Favia, P., Iacoviello, G., & D'Agostino, R. (2004). Effect of Ag-containing nano-composite active packaging system on survival of Alicyclobacillus acidoterrestris. *Journal of Food Science*, 69(8), E379-E383.
- Nabika, H., & Unoura, K. (2016). Interaction between nanoparticles and cell membrane. In *Surface chemistry of nanobiomaterials* (pp. 231-263). William Andrew Publishing.
- 71. Ni, M., Leung, M. K., Leung, D. Y., & Sumathy, K. (2007). A review and recent developments in photocatalytic water-splitting using TiO₂ for hydrogen production. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 11(3), 401-425.
- 72. OECD. (2009). Report of an OECD workshop on exposure assessment and exposure mitigation: manufactured nanomaterials. Technical report, OECD environment, health and safety publications, series on the safety of manufactured nanomaterials. *Organisation for Economic*, 13.
- 73. Pirsa, S., & Shamusi, T. (2019). Intelligent and active packaging of chicken thigh meat by conducting nano structure cellulose-polypyrrole-ZnO film. *Materials Science and Engineering: C*, 102, 798-809.
- 74. Philippopoulos, C. J., & Nikolaki, M. D. (2010). Photocatalytic processes on the oxidation of organic compounds in water. In *New trends in technologies*. IntechOpen.
- 75. Pozzo, R. L., Baltanas, M. A., & Cassano, A. E. (1997). Supported titanium oxide as photocatalyst in water decontamination: state of the art. *Catalysis Today*, *39*(3), 219-231.
- Pleskova, S. N., Golubeva, I. S., & Verevkin, Y. K. (2016). Bactericidal activity of titanium dioxide ultraviolet-induced films. *Materials Science and Engineering: C, 59*, 807-817.
- 77. Proquin, H., Rodríguez-Ibarra, C., Moonen, C. G., Urrutia Ortega, I. M., Briedé, J. J., de Kok, T. M., ... & Chirino, Y. I. (2017). Titanium dioxide food additive (E171) induces ROS formation and genotoxicity: contribution of micro and nano-sized fractions. *Mutagenesis*, *32*(1), 139-149.
- 78. Reidy, D. J., Holmes, J. D., & Morris, M. A. (2006). Preparation of a highly thermally stable titania anatase phase by addition of mixed zirconia and silica dopants. *Ceramics International*, *32*(3), 235-239.
- 79. Rincón, A. G., & Pulgarin, C. (2007). Absence of E. coli regrowth after Fe^{3+} and TiO_2 solar photoassisted disinfection of water in CPC solar photoreactor. *Catalysis Today*, 124(3-4), 204-214.



- 80. Sun, J., Jiang, H., Wu, H., Tong, C., Pang, J., & Wu, C. (2020). Multifunctional bionanocomposite films based on konjac glucomannan/chitosan with nano-ZnO and mulberry anthocyanin extract for active food packaging. *Food Hydrocolloids, 107*, 105942.
- 81. Sawunyama, P., Jiang, L., Fujishima, A., & Hashimoto, K. (1997). Photodecomposition of a Langmuir–Blodgett film of stearic acid on TiO₂ film observed by in situ atomic force microscopy and FT-IR. *The Journal of Physical Chemistry B*, 101(51), 11000-11003.
- Shakeel, M., Jabeen, F., Shabbir, S., Asghar, M. S., Khan, M. S., & Chaudhry, A. S. (2016). Toxicity of nano-titanium dioxide (TiO₂-NP) through various routes of exposure: a review. *Biological Trace Element Research*, *172*, 1-36.
- Szentkuti, L. (1997). Light microscopical observations on luminally administered dyes, dextrans, nanospheres and microspheres in the preepithelial mucus gel layer of the rat distal colon. *Journal of Controlled Release*, 46(3), 233-242.
- 84. Sharma, S., Sharma, R. K., Gaur, K., Cátala Torres, J. F., Loza-Rosas, S. A., Torres, A., ... & Tinoco, A. D. (2019). Fueling a hot debate on the application of TiO₂ nanoparticles in sunscreen. *Materials*, *12*(14), 2317.
- 85. Tharanathan, R. N. (2003). Biodegradable films and composite coatings: past, present and future. *Trends in Food Science & Technology*, *14*(3), 71-78.
- 86. Thiruvenkatachari, R., Vigneswaran, S., & Moon, I. S. (2008). A review on UV/TiO₂ photocatalytic oxidation process (Journal Review). *Korean Journal of Chemical Engineering*, 25, 64-72.
- 87. Talamini, L., Gimondi, S., Violatto, M. B., Fiordaliso, F., Pedica, F., Tran, N. L., ... & Diomede, L. (2019). Repeated administration of the food additive E171 to mice results in accumulation in intestine and liver and promotes an inflammatory status. *Nanotoxicology*, *13*(8), 1087-1101.
- Umadevi, M., Sangari, M., Parimaladevi, R., Sivanantham, A., & Mayandi, J. (2013). Enhanced photocatalytic, antimicrobial activity and photovoltaic

characteristics of fluorine doped TiO₂ synthesized under ultrasound irradiation. *Journal of Fluorine Chemistry*, *156*, 209-213.

- Winkler, H. C., Notter, T., Meyer, U., & Naegeli, H. (2018). Critical review of the safety assessment of titanium dioxide additives in food. *Journal of Nanobiotechnology*, 16, 1-19.
- 90. Wang, Y., Zhu, X., Lao, Y., Lv, X., Tao, Y., Huang, B., ... & Cai, Z. (2016). TiO₂ nanoparticles in the marine environment: physical effects responsible for the toxicity on algae Phaeodactylum tricornutum. *Science of the Total Environment*, 565, 818-826.
- Wojcieszek, J., Jiménez-Lamana, J., Ruzik, L., Asztemborska, M., Jarosz, M., & Szpunar, J. (2020). Characterization of TiO₂ NPs in radish (Raphanus sativus L.) by single-particle ICP-QQQ-MS. *Frontiers in Environmental Science*, 8, 100.
- 92. Weir, A., Westerhoff, P., Fabricius, L., Hristovski, K., & Von Goetz, N. (2012). Titanium dioxide nanoparticles in food and personal care products. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 46(4), 2242-2250.
- 93. Xing, Y., Li, X., Zhang, L., Xu, Q., Che, Z., Li, W., ... & Li, K. (2012). Effect of TiO₂ nanoparticles on the antibacterial and physical properties of polyethylene-based film. *Progress in Organic Coatings*, 73(2-3), 219-224.
- 94. Yu, B., Leung, K. M., Guo, Q., Lau, W. M., & Yang, J. (2011). Synthesis of Ag-TiO₂ composite nano thin film for antimicrobial application. *Nanotechnology*, 22(11), 115603.
- 95. Zou, L., & Zhu, B. (2007). Enhancing the reuse of treated effluent by photocatalytic process. *Journal of Advanced Oxidation Technologies*, 10(2), 273-281.
- 96. Zhang, W., Zou, L., & Wang, L. (2009). Photocatalytic TiO₂/adsorbent nanocomposites prepared via wet chemical impregnation for wastewater treatment: A review. *Applied Catalysis A: General*, 371(1-2), 1-9.
- 97. Zaiter, T., Cornu, R., El Basset, W., Martin, H., Diab, M., & Béduneau, A. (2022). Toxicity assessment of nanoparticles in contact with the skin. *Journal of Nanoparticle Research*, 24(7), 149.

